



**CITY OF BOULDER
CITY COUNCIL AGENDA ITEM**

MEETING DATE: December 7, 2023

AGENDA TITLE

Second reading and consideration of a motion to adopt Ordinance 8611 designating the property at 604 Mapleton Ave., City of Boulder, Colorado, to be known as the Eastman-Reid-Collins House, as an individual landmark under Chapter 9-11, “Historic Preservation,” B.R.C. 1981; and setting forth related details.

Owner / Applicant: Judith Reid and Richard Collins

PRESENTERS

Nuria Rivera-Vandermyde, City Manager
Brad Mueller, Director of Planning and Development Services
Kristofer Johnson, Comprehensive Planning Senior Manager
Lucas Markley, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney’s Office
Marcy Gerwing, Principal Historic Preservation Planner
Clare Brandt, Historic Preservation Planner

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this agenda item is for City Council to consider second reading of an ordinance designating the property at 604 Mapleton Ave. as an individual landmark under the city’s Historic Preservation Ordinance. The council must determine whether the proposed individual landmark designation of the property meets the purposes and standards of the Historic Preservation Ordinance (*Sections 9-11-1 and 9-11-2, B.R.C. 1981*). This includes that the landmark designation:

- 1. Will promote the public health, safety, and welfare by protecting, enhancing, and perpetuating buildings, sites, and areas of the city reminiscent of past eras, events, and persons important in local, state, or national history or providing significant examples of architectural styles of the past.*

2. *Will develop and maintain appropriate settings and environments for such buildings, sites, and areas to enhance property values, stabilize neighborhoods, promote tourist trade and interest, and foster knowledge of the city's living heritage.*
3. *Will draw a reasonable balance between private property rights and the public interest in preserving the city's cultural, historic, and architectural heritage by ensuring that demolition of buildings and structures important to that heritage will be carefully weighed with other alternatives and that alterations to such buildings and structures and new construction will respect the character of each such setting, not by imitating surrounding structures, but by being compatible with them.*

The property owners are in support of the designation. The property is already designated as part of the Mapleton Hill Historic District. However, the owner would like to recognize the building individually. If approved, this ordinance (see **Attachment A**), would result in the designation of the property as an individual landmark. The findings are included in the ordinance. This second reading for this designation is a quasi-judicial public hearing.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Suggested Motion Language:

Staff requests council consideration of this matter and action in the form of the following motion:

Motion to adopt Ordinance 8611 designating the property at 604 Mapleton Ave., City of Boulder, Colorado, to be known as the Eastman-Reid-Collins House, as an individual landmark under the City of Boulder Historic Preservation Ordinance.

COMMUNITY SUSTAINABILITY ASSESSMENTS AND IMPACTS

- Economic - Studies have found that historic preservation adds to economic vitality and tourism. Exterior changes to individually landmarked buildings require a Landmark Alteration Certificate, issued by the Planning Department at no charge. The additional review process for landmarked buildings may, however, add time and design expense to a project.
- Environmental - The preservation of historic buildings is inherently sustainable. Owners of individually landmarked buildings are encouraged to reuse and repair as much of the original building as possible when making exterior alterations, thereby reducing the amount of building material waste deposited in landfills. City staff assists architects, contractors and homeowners with design and material selections and sources that are environmentally friendly. Also, the Historic Preservation website provides information on improving the energy efficiency of older buildings.

- Social - The Historic Preservation Ordinance was adopted to “...enhance property values, stabilize neighborhoods, promote tourist trade and interest, and foster knowledge of the city’s living heritage.” Section 9-11-1 (a), B.R.C., 1981. The primary beneficiaries of historic designation are the property owners of a historic landmark and adjacent neighbors, who are ensured that the character of the immediate area will be protected through the design review process. The greater community also benefits from the preservation of the community’s character and history.

OTHER IMPACTS

- Fiscal - The designation of individual historic landmarks is an anticipated and ongoing function of the Historic Preservation Program.
- Staff time - This designation application is within the staff work plan.

RESPONSES TO QUESTIONS FROM COUNCIL AGENDA COMMITTEE

LANDMARKS BOARD ACTIONS & FEEDBACK

On September 6, 2023, the Landmarks Board voted (**4-0**, Castellano absent) to recommend that the City Council designate the property as a local historic landmark, finding that it meets the standards for individual landmark designations in sections 9-11-1 and 9-11-2, B.R.C. 1981, and is consistent with the criteria specified in section 9-11-5(c), B.R.C. 1981.

PUBLIC FEEDBACK

None received.

ANALYSIS

Code Criteria for Review

Section 9-11-6(b) *Council Ordinance Designating Landmark or Historic District*, of the historic preservation ordinance specifies that in its review of an application for local landmark designation, the council must consider “whether the designation meets the purposes and standards in Subsections 9-11-1(a) and Section 9-11-2, *City Council May Designate Landmarks and Historic Districts*, B.R.C. 1981, in balance with the goals and policies of the Boulder Valley Comprehensive Plan.” The City Council shall approve by ordinance, modify and approve by ordinance, or disapprove the proposed designation.

9-11-1, *Legislative Intent*, B.R.C. 1981 states:

- (a) The purpose of this chapter is to promote the public health, safety, and welfare by protecting, enhancing, and perpetuating buildings, sites, and areas of the city reminiscent of past eras, events, and persons important in local, state, or national history or providing significant examples of architectural styles of the past. It is also the purpose of this chapter to develop and maintain appropriate settings and environments for such buildings, sites, and areas to enhance property values, stabilize neighborhoods, promote tourist trade and interest, and foster knowledge of the city’s living heritage.

- (b) The City Council does not intend by this chapter to preserve every old building in the city but instead to draw a reasonable balance between private property rights and the public interest in preserving the city's cultural, historic, and architectural heritage by ensuring that demolition of buildings and structures important to that heritage will be carefully weighed with other alternatives and that alterations to such buildings and structures and new construction will respect the character of each such setting, not by imitating surrounding structures, but by being compatible with them.
- (c) The City Council intends that in reviewing applications for alterations to and new construction on landmarks or structures in a historic district, the Landmarks Board shall follow relevant city policies, including, without limitation, energy-efficient design, access for the disabled, and creative approaches to renovation.

9-11-2, *City Council may Designate Landmarks and Historic Districts, B.R.C. 1981*
states:

- (a) Pursuant to the procedures in this chapter the City Council may by ordinance:
 - (1) Designate as a landmark an individual building or other feature or an integrated group of structures or features on a single lot or site having a special character and historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value and designate a landmark site for each landmark;
 - (2) Designate as a historic district a contiguous area containing a number of sites, buildings, structures or features having a special character and historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value and constituting a distinct section of the city;
 - (3) Designate as a discontinuous historic district a collection of sites, buildings, structures, or features which are contained in two or more geographically separate areas, having a special character and historical, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value that are united together by historical, architectural, or aesthetic characteristics; and
 - (4) Amend designations to add features or property to or from the site or district.

Upon designation, the property included in any such designation is subject to all the requirements of this code and other ordinances of the city.



Figure 1. 604 Mapleton Ave. c. 1929. Real Estate Appraisal image.



Figure 2. Left: 604 Mapleton Ave. 1986 Historic Building Inventory image. Right: 2023

Summary of Significance

To assist in the interpretation of the historic preservation ordinance, the Landmarks Board adopted an administrative regulation in 1975 establishing [Significance Criteria for Individual Landmarks](#) (link). For additional information on the history of the property, please see the [September 6, 2023 Landmarks Board Memorandum](#) (link).

ANALYSIS:

- A. Would the designation protect, enhance, and perpetuate a property reminiscent of a past era(s), event(s), and person(s) important in local, state, or national history in Boulder or provide a significant example of architecture of the past?***

Staff considers, and the Landmarks Board found, that the proposed designation will protect, enhance, and perpetuate a building and site reminiscent of a past era, past events, and persons important in local history and preserve an important example of Boulder's historic architecture.

- B. Does the proposed application develop and maintain appropriate settings and environments for such buildings, sites, and areas to enhance property values,***

stabilize neighborhoods, promote tourist trade and interest, and foster knowledge of the City's living heritage?

Staff considers, and the Landmarks Board found, that the proposed designation will maintain an appropriate setting and environment for the buildings and sites, and enhance property values, stabilize the neighborhood, promote tourist trade and interest, and foster knowledge of the city's living heritage.

HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE:

Summary: The house located at 604 Mapleton Ave. meets the following historic significance criteria:

1. Date of Construction: 1913

Elaboration: The house was constructed in 1913, according to Sanborn Fire Insurance map records¹ and the Boulder County Assessor.²

2. Association with Persons or Events: Associated with the Eastman Family; Andrew and Josephine Zangara; the Benson Family; René and Charlotte Wolf; and Richard Collins and Judith Reid, families prominent in Boulder community and business activities.

Elaboration: The house was constructed for Frank and Asenath Eastman and their two children. Frank Eastman was treasurer of Western States Cutlery Company in 1910³, a stockbroker in 1930⁴, and co-founder and president of the Lashley-Persons Investment Company by 1933. He was "one of the most popular and highly respected citizens of Boulder."⁵ He was born in New Hampshire on January 8, 1865 and died in 1933. Mrs. Eastman was born Asenath Klepper on September 15, 1866, in Illinois. She and Frank married in 1889 and they had two children together: Leslie (born in 1899) and Harold (born in 1897). Asenath Eastman died in 1950 after a long illness. Richard Collins and Judith Reid purchased it in 1975. Collins spent a legal career fighting for Native American Rights; Reid for women's rights and civic equity.

3. Development of the Community: Mapleton Hill Historic District

¹ "Sanborn Fire Insurance Map" July 1910. <https://www.loc.gov/resource/g4314bm.g009581910/?sp=2> and March 1918. <https://www.loc.gov/resource/g4314bm.g009581918/?sp=2&st=image&r=0.512,0.488,0.523,0.255,0>

² Boulder County Assessor. "604 Mapleton Avenue real estate appraisal." Call Number 880-Mapleton-604. 1929-1963. Carnegie Library for Local History, Boulder.

<https://localhistory.boulderlibrary.org/islandora/object/islandora%3A84003>

³ Federal Census Record. "Frank H. Eastman." 1920. <https://www.ancestry.com/discoveryui-content/view/62272471:6061>

⁴ Federal Census Record. "Frank H. Eastman." 1930. <https://www.ancestry.com/discoveryui-content/view/101341772:6224>

⁵ "Frank Eastman Funeral Held At His Home Today." 1933. Call Number VF-Eastman. Carnegie Library for Local History, Boulder.

Elaboration: The area represents Boulder’s growth. Frank Eastman, for whom the house was constructed, was a wealthy professional: a stockbroker in 1930, and co-founder and president of the Lashley-Persons Investment Company by 1933. The house is distinct within the district for its style and size spanning multiple lots.

4. **Recognition by Authorities:** Identified as a contributing resource in the Mapleton Hill Historic District (1982); Front Range Research Associates (1986); featured in “Historic Homes of Boulder County: Eastman House” (1979); included in the “Use of Native Stone” historic context report (1999).

ARCHITECTURAL SIGNIFICANCE:

Summary: The house at 604 Mapleton Ave. meets the following architectural significance criteria.

1. **Recognized Period or Style:** Tudor Revival

Elaboration: From *History Colorado*: “The most dominant features of the Tudor Revival style are the false or ornamental half-timbering, which covers the upper story, and the steeply pitched roof. Exterior texturing, through the use of brick, stone, or stucco, together with the half-timbering and asymmetrical massing, gives a Tudor Revival style building a picturesque composition.”

2. **Architect or Builder of Prominence:** Arthur E. Saunders

Elaboration: The house was likely designed by Arthur E. Saunders (1860-1930), who additionally designed 410 Highland Ave. and the Howe Mortuary at 1045 Spruce St. (both within the Mapleton Hill Historic District), the Mercantile Bank at 1201 Pearl St., and multiple other buildings.

3. **Artistic Merit:** Masonry

Elaboration: The masonry detailing, such as the brick lintels with stone detailing at the corners show exceptional skill.

4. **Example of the Uncommon:** Narrow brick porte cochere (carriage porch), carriage steps, and attached one-story hipped-roof garage.

Elaboration: The automobile arrived in Boulder around 1904. The inclusion of these original features in 1913 (and no carriage house on the property) demonstrates the changes in architecture due to the increasing popularity of the automobile.

5. **Indigenous Qualities:** Utilized local stone and brick.

ENVIRONMENTAL SIGNIFICANCE:

Summary: The house located at 604 Mapleton Ave. meets the following environmental significance criteria.

- 1. Site Characteristics:** The orientation of the house on the corner lot allows for the façade to face Mapleton Avenue, allows cars (or carriage) to enter from either Mapleton Avenue or 6th Street, and draw up to the side of the house and access the attached garage.
- 2. Compatibility with Site:** Consistent with similarly grand houses in the district, the house spans multiple lots on the corner and is set back from the street. The house contributes to the architectural variety and character of the Mapleton Hill Historic District.
- 3. Geographic Importance:** The house is a prominent and familiar visual landmark within the Mapleton Hill Historic District.
- 4. Environmental Appropriateness:** None observed.
- 5. Area Integrity:** The property is located in the Mapleton Hill Historic District, which retains a high degree of historic integrity.

Landmark Name

Staff recommends the property be known as the **Eastman-Reid-Collins House** to recognize the original owners, Frank and Asenath Eastman and the civic contributions of the longest owners, Richard Collins and Judith Reid, who have been careful stewards of the house since 1975. This is consistent with the Landmark Board's Guidelines for Names of Landmarked Structures and Sites (1988) and the National Register of Historic Places Guidelines for Designation. See [Guidelines for Names of Landmarked Structures and Sites](#) (link).

Boundary Analysis

Staff and the Landmarks Board recommend that the boundary be established to follow the property lines of the lot, which is the boundary proposed by the applicant and is consistent with current and past practices and the National Register Guidelines for establishing landmark boundaries.

Alternatives

Modify the Application: The City Council may modify the landmark boundary and landmark name.

Deny the Application: If the City Council finds the application does not meet the criteria for landmark designation, it would vote to deny the application.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment A – Ordinance 8611

Attachment B – [Significance Criteria for Individual Landmarks](#) (1975) (link)

Attachment C – [May 3, 2023 Landmarks Board Memorandum](#) (link)

ORDINANCE 8611

AN ORDINANCE DESIGNATING THE PROPERTY AT 604 MAPLETON AVE., CITY OF BOULDER, COLORADO, ALSO KNOWN AS THE EASTMAN-REID-COLLINS HOUSE, A LANDMARK UNDER CHAPTER 9-11, "HISTORIC PRESERVATION," B.R.C. 1981, AND SETTING FORTH RELATED DETAILS.

BE IT ORDAINED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BOULDER, COLORADO:

Section 1. The City Council enacts this ordinance pursuant to its authority under Chapter 9-11, "Historic Preservation," B.R.C. 1981, to designate as a landmark a property having a special character or special historic, architectural, or aesthetic interest or value.

Section 2. The City Council finds that: 1) on June 23, 2023, the property owners submitted a landmark designation application for the property; 2) the Landmarks Board held a public hearing on the proposed designation on September 6, 2023, and recommended that the City Council approve the proposed designation.

Section 3. The City Council also finds that upon public notice required by law, the City Council held a public hearing on the proposed designation on December 7, 2023, and upon the basis of the presentations at that hearing finds that the property at 604 Mapleton Ave. possesses special historic and architectural value warranting its designation as a landmark.

Section 4. The characteristics of the subject property that justify its designation as a landmark are: 1) its historic significance for its date of construction of 1913 for Frank and Asenath Eastman and their two children; for its association with multiple families prominent in Boulder community and business activities; as a contributing resource in the Mapleton Hill Historic District distinguished by its style and size spanning multiple lots; and 2) its architectural significance as an example of the Tudor Revival style designed by Arthur E. Saunders; its artistic merit representing

1 skillful masonry detailing, such as the brick lintels with stone detailing; as an example of the
2 uncommon with a narrow brick porte cochere (carriage porch), carriage steps, and attached one-story
3 hipped-roof garage, the inclusion of which demonstrates the changes in architecture due to the
4 increasing popularity of the automobile; and 3) its environmental significance as a visual landmark
5 within the Mapleton Hill Historic District; its orientation on the corner lot; and presence of mature
6 street trees compatible within the context of the Mapleton Hill Historic District and surrounding
7 residential context.

8 Section 5. The City Council further finds that the foregoing landmark designation is
9 necessary to promote the public health, safety, and welfare of the residents of the city.

10 Section 6. There is hereby created as a landmark the property located at 604 Mapleton
11 Ave., also known as the Eastman-Reid-Collins House, whose legal landmark boundary encompasses
12 the legal lots upon which it sits:
13

14 LEGAL DESCRIPTION

15 LOTS 21 22 23 & 24 BLK 6 MAPLETON

16 as depicted in the proposed landmark boundary map, attached hereto as Exhibit A.

17 Section 7. The City Council directs that the Planning and Development Services
18 Department give prompt notice of this designation to the property owner and cause a copy of this
19 ordinance to be recorded as described in Subsection 9-11-6(d), B.R.C. 1981.

20 Section 8. The City Council deems it appropriate that this ordinance be published by title
21 only and orders that copies of this ordinance be made available in the office of the City Clerk for
22 public inspection and acquisition.
23
24
25

1 INTRODUCED, READ ON FIRST READING, AND ORDERED PUBLISHED BY
2 TITLE ONLY THIS 16th day of November 2023.
3

4 _____
Aaron Brockett,
5 Mayor

6 Attest:
7

8 _____
City Clerk

9 READ ON SECOND READING, PASSED AND ADOPTED, this 7th day of December
10 2023.
11

12 _____
Aaron Brockett,
13 Mayor

14 Attest:
15

16 _____
City Clerk
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Exhibit A – Landmark Boundary Map for 604 Mapleton Ave.

604 Mapleton Ave., Boulder, Colorado
LOTS 21 22 23 & 24 BLK 6 MAPLETON

